

Cultural Value 2014 Project Summaries

Critical Review

Grant Holder: Dr Hilary Bungay

Project Title: Caregivers perceptions of the value of the arts in therapeutic and clinical interventions.

Summary: The aim of the proposed critical review is to provide a general update on the Staricoff (2004) and Staricoff and Clift (2012) reviews on the medical literature on the arts and health with a specific focus on the hitherto underexplored area of health care professionals' attitudes to the use of cultural activities in clinical and therapeutic settings. Staricoff's seminal review (2004) identified a number of benefits to using arts in health care settings; this review was recently updated by Staricoff and Clift (2012) and both reviews found evidence that arts and particularly music produced psychological and physiological outcomes in hospital environments, in the clinical areas of maternity, neonatal and intensive care, children, cardiovascular conditions, surgery and pain management, lung disease and oncology. There have also been reviews of the use of the arts in dementia care (Sherratt et al 2004) and the field of mental health (Daykin et al 2008). The Staricoff review (2004) considered the outcomes on staff of arts interventions and found studies concerning job satisfaction, and the use of the arts in medical and nursing training to improve communication, empathy and understanding of patients' needs. The therapeutic effects of the arts in health care are well documented overall but there remains a gap in our understanding as to whether the introduction of cultural activities into healthcare has an impact on the interactions between staff and the patient, or on the recruitment and retention of staff. The gap in critical reviews of the literature around the attitudes of health or social care professionals to the use of the cultural activities in clinical or therapeutic settings is important to address because establishing successful projects in health care environments is reliant on the co-operation of the staff working in these settings. Therefore the purpose of the proposed critical review is not only to update the Staricoff (2004) and Staricoff and Clift (2012) reviews but more specifically to explore health care professionals' attitudes to the use of cultural activities in clinical and therapeutic settings. The review will investigate three main areas: the perceptions of care givers on the use of the arts in enhancing the health and well-being in clinical and therapeutic settings, the impact of using the arts not only on the patient/service user but also on the healthcare professionals themselves, and whether engaging with arts activities in the workplace may have the potential to improve self-esteem and so reduce staff turnover. The review will focus on studies published from 2004 to the present, although it may also include a selection of papers from outside this period which are relevant and significant to one of the stated areas of interest. Based on the keywords outlined in the full proposal key electronic databases and internet sites will be searched, to identify published empirical research and 'grey literature' including Medline for healthcare in general, medicine and mental health, CINAHL (Cumulative Index to Nursing and Allied Health Literature) and BNI (British Nursing Index) for nursing issues and the Cochrane Library for reviews on healthcare.

Grant Holder: Dr Peter Campbell

Project Title: The role of arts and culture in the regeneration of urban places and urban communities' - Critical Review

Summary: This project will produce a critical review of the current knowledge base concerning the role of arts and culture in the regeneration of urban places and communities. Its key objective is to review a wide range of existing research in order to better understand the myriad ways in which arts and culture are seen as capable of achieving 'urban regeneration', and the ways in which 'cultural value' is constructed in research which seeks to evaluate this regeneration. A typology will be created which will combine: - An assessment of the diverse forms of cultural value which 'regenerative' activities seek to create (is 'regeneration', for example, achieved by intervening in the built environment? Promoting new cultural businesses? Increasing tourism? Attracting new audiences? Encouraging 'grassroots' community activity?) - An examination of the methodological approaches taken in assessing this value (are audience surveys carried out? Participants interviewed? Expert opinion sought? Economic impact statements created?) - A critique of the efficacy of these approaches (who uses these research findings? What arguments do they support? Are these robust?) In critically assessing methodological approaches to evidence-gathering, this project thus seeks to examine how particular constructions of value in the discourse concerning culture and urban regeneration are formulated with reference to a range of influential contextual factors (including public policy, the type of arts and cultural activity being evaluated, the circumstances of the commissioning of research, and the available resources to develop evidence). It also aims to identify existing strengths and weaknesses (or gaps) in current understanding, and suggest ways in which improved understanding may be achieved, and so articulate a more nuanced understanding of the factors at play in understanding the role of 'culture' in urban regeneration. Crucially, this reviewing process seeks to understand interventions in this area not just from a critical theoretical and methodological perspective, but also from a practitioner viewpoint. As so much evidence gathering occurs beyond the realms of the academy, sustained engagement with evaluations and other documentary evidence produced by external practitioners throughout the project is considered to be vital to achieving a rounded understanding of this area, and also in ensuring that the findings from this project are disseminated beyond the academic context.

Grant Holder: Professor Paul Cooke

Project Title: Experiencing the Digital World: the Cultural Value of Digital Engagement with Heritage

Summary: The aim of this project is to provide a critical review of the role of digital engagement and access in shaping cultural experiences in the context of museums, galleries and heritage. Since the late 1990s the potential of the digital world for generating new ways of engaging with the heritage sector, widely defined, has been a key focus of both academic work and cultural practice. Academics and practitioners alike have explored the potential of digital technology for offering new insights into our understanding of the past for an ever wider section of society. This has taken a number of forms, from 3D modelling of archaeological sites to large-scale digitisation projects for the long-term preservation and curation of material heritage. At the same time, colleagues have explored the ways in which the digital world can be used as a tool for increasing and broadening public participation in heritage culture. On the one hand, this has focussed on how the internet can help provide a 'shop window' for museums, galleries and heritage, and translate this into physical visits to sites. On the other, the sector increasingly seeks to use the digital sphere to provide a space for more dynamic, two-way engagement with heritage culture, aimed at providing a complementary experience to the physical visit that can, in turn, enhance the cultural value of heritage through a range of phenomena (e.g. user-generated content, online communities, crowdsourcing projects). The last decade has seen a huge number of digital projects take place on a variety of scales operating in a whole host of heritage cultures around the world. These provide a plethora of case studies for the potential of the digital both to widen access to the world's heritage and provide new ways for individuals and communities to experience and consume heritage, from the Europeana Foundation - an interactive forum which provides access to millions of artefacts from across Europe - to small scale projects such as the 'Ostalgie Kabinett' which helps support community engagement with the historical memory of the former East German State. At the same time, there has been a growing emphasis, both amongst scholarly and grey literature, on how we measure the value of this activity and what we mean by value in this context. As Parry (2010) highlights, this is an area of activity which can easily 'fetishise the future, and neglect the past'. Or it has potential, somewhat counter intuitively perhaps, to help limit access to material culture, locking it away behind a 'protective' digital wall (Cameron and Kenderdine 2010). Our review will examine this tension through the critical lens of 'cultural value', placing discussion of digital engagement within the broader literature on interactivity and participation with heritage per se, the potential for co-production in research and the ramifications this can have on the question of the 'ownership' of heritage, all issues that shape current conceptualisations of the relationship between the physical and the digital sphere. The aim of this CR is threefold. 1) It will give an overview of the ways in which the heritage sector currently engages with the digital world, providing a range of international case studies in order to highlight leading-edge practice globally. 2) These case studies will be embedded within a critical analysis of the scholarly and grey literature, and in particular an investigation of how the literature has sought to understand the issue of 'value' in this context. 3) The findings of the critical review will be evaluated, via a workshop to be held at Leeds, by an international group of heritage professionals in order to explore what they perceive to be the continuing gaps in the literature and potential new directions for museological and

heritage practice. This will, in turn, also lead to the production of briefing document for heritage professionals looking to enhance their digital engagement with audiences.

Grant Holder: Ms Jocelyn Dodd

Project Title: The Cultural Value of Engaging with Museums and Galleries

Summary: Whilst recent decades have produced a relatively consistent and compelling body of data around use and participation in museums and galleries - generating a degree of consensus amongst policymakers, funders and practitioners around demographic patterns and trends in visiting - there is much less consensus around what we know about the value of this engagement. Numerous studies (using a range of methods and shaped by a variety of motivations) have set out to describe, understand, measure and evidence what it is that people value about museum and gallery visiting, what benefits accrue from engagement and participation and what longer term impacts result from this engagement for individuals and society more broadly. However, there has been no systematic attempt to draw together and critically assess this body of research in order to build a clear understanding of what these diverse studies and approaches tell us, what gaps exist and what future research directions are needed. The proposed review addresses these long overdue questions to provide insights of value to policymakers, funders and practitioners.

Grant Holder: Dr Shona Kelly

Project Title: A Critical Review of the Effectiveness of the Therapeutic Use of Artistic Activity

Summary: Within the body of research on arts and healthcare, there have been attempts at measuring and valuing the effects of the arts on clinical outcomes although often this is context specific (e.g. for specific amenities or initiatives/programmes in specific locations) and lacking a policy purpose. Despite this, the role and value of the arts in healthcare continues to be recognised and carry weight in policy terms. Although there is also evidence of silos of knowledge, and critics point out that there is a split between individualised notions of maintaining health and a more socially determined appreciation of the impacts of health inequalities and social interactions on everyone. Both arts and health operate across both sides of this divide but rarely are seen in this dual context. We propose to conduct a multi-dimensional critical review of the effectiveness of art therapy for the patient, published in academic journal articles and articles written for a healthcare audience (e.g. practitioner, healthcare manager/provider or policy), that has the stated goal of providing evidence of therapeutic benefit from an artistic activity through measurement of a health state. We will follow the processes used within public health for conducting a critical review of literature on a body of mixed research-study designs. This will involve setting out pre-determined criteria for literature to be included in the study; double reading all the papers and classifying the literature by study design, health state, stated therapeutic mechanism; expert assessment of possible therapeutic mechanism; and finally providing a narrative summary of the findings based on the quality of evidence and the volume of available evidence. The approach we will adopt for reviewing the literature will enable the current state of knowledge about the value of arts and culture in clinical and therapeutic contexts to be consolidated in relation to the overall quality of evidence. By adopting a recognised public health process to review and synthesise a large body of low-quality evidence we are using the current body of research to best advantage rather than simply criticising the quality. This will provide a holistic and, up to date, picture of the state of knowledge in the area of arts and therapeutic and clinical interventions, which is robust and transparent. In addition we will provide new ways of classifying the techniques which move beyond the simple classifications based on the form of the media (eg, music based or fibre art based therapies).

Grant Holder: Professor Kate Oakley

Project Title: Creating Space: A re-evaluation of the role of culture in regeneration

Summary: This application proposes to conduct a critical review of the literature of the role of art and culture in the regeneration of urban places and communities. It will focus primarily on the academic literature, but, given the nature of the field, will also review relevant policy literature. Its starting point is that much of the academic literature argues that culturally-led regeneration efforts have often failed, at least in terms of delivering the widespread social benefits that many have promised. Too often these developments have led to rising land values, rising rents and the eventual eviction of low income households, artists and even small cultural businesses. The conflicts produced by these sort of gentrification processes is well covered in existing literature. Given this, this critical review proposes three areas for research that will take this debate in new and hopefully, fruitful directions: 1. To reconsider the idea of 'urban' in the cultural regeneration literature. Although the focus of much of the literature is on larger, urban centres; an emerging literature suggests a different, and perhaps more sustainable set of outcomes outside of these sites. What can we learn from literature on the role of culture suburbs, rural areas and small towns? What are the implications for larger cultural institutions often associated with metropolises? What cultural forms eg. craft or festivals are linked to regeneration in smaller towns and cities? What scale is most appropriate for cultural regeneration? 2. To present a global survey of the literature, which specifically seeks out work not limited to the UK and North American experience. What are the different models of urban regeneration arising in different global contexts? What are the links between urban regeneration and development in the Global South? Are there particular regional approaches eg. Latin America, that could form a distinctive approach to regeneration? 3. To consider the 'new politics of place' and its links to culture and urban regeneration. Movements such as Occupy have re-focussed attention on the importance of public space, community and conviviality, an element of cultural regeneration that has often been over-looked in the focus on new, built infrastructure. What, if anything, is the specific role for artists in this new politics? Beyond the 'flagship' building; what sort of cultural infrastructure really matters? What are the links between cultural and social movements in the new politics of place?

Grant Holder: Dr Jasjit Singh

Project Title: An analysis and review of British South Asian engagement in minority ethnic arts

Summary: The aim of this research project is to provide a critical review of the place and value of minority ethnic arts in the lives of British South Asians by examining literature on the development of South Asian arts in Britain as well as exploring what has been written about British South Asian engagement in the arts. By using British South Asians as a case study rather than trying to examine cultural and creative engagement across all BME communities, this research will present a focused analysis of the development of and contemporary place of South Asian Arts in Britain. Given that British South Asians are a well established community in Britain this review will aim to present a chronological investigation of the emergence and development of South Asian arts in Britain. The key research question being examined is 'Why and in what ways do members of the British South Asian community engage with the arts and what value do they attach to this engagement?' Within this main research question a number of further questions are addressed: How has the South Asian arts scene developed in Britain? Which factors influence British South Asian engagement with particular types of art (e.g. age, gender, religiosity, language, socioeconomic background etc)? What role is played by South Asian arts organisations and which sorts of arts do these organisations offer? How does engagement with minority ethnic art impact on religious identity and conversely how does the strength of religious identity influence engagement with the arts? What cultural value do South Asians themselves place on the arts and how is this manifested in career choices among young South Asians? Who beyond members of minority ethnic communities engages with minority ethnic arts? Why are many of these organisations defined as 'South Asian' as opposed to Indian / Pakistani / Hindu / Sikh / Muslim? Are South Asians aware of any inherent value in engaging with arts relating to their own ethnic and/or religious backgrounds as opposed to engaging with 'mainstream' arts? This research project will also look to uncover examples of 'hidden' minority arts events which are often only advertised within particular networks and which usually take place in venues owned or run for members of minority ethnic communities including religious institutions and cultural centres. As well as undertaking a review of research and reports into South Asian Arts, an online survey will be used to investigate these hidden events through the networks created with South Asian Arts organisations. The survey will be hosted on the project website and advertised through South Asian networks and social media. The expected outputs from this project will be: 1. A report consisting of a critical review of the literature on minority ethnic arts; 2. Findings from the quantitative and qualitative online survey made available on the project website; 3. A journal article targeted at the journal "South Asian Popular Culture", authored by the PI; 4. Conference presentations including the BASAS (British Association of South Asian Studies) 2014 conference; 5. Community presentations to take place at venues arranged by the South Asian Arts organisations participating in the research; 6. Policy briefings for South Asian Arts professionals and relevant policy makers containing a digest of the critical review and recommendations for future practices available on the project website; 7. Possibility of dissemination via the BBC Asian Network and/or BBC Radio 4's 'The Culture Show' The audience of these outputs will be academics working on cultural value and on minority ethnic arts, South Asian Arts professionals, policy makers who need a nuanced understanding of how different parts of British society engage with the

arts, and ordinary people with an interest in understanding the history and place of South Asian arts in Britain.